Chapter One

BACKGROUND INFORMATION

Internet is transforming the country into multi-dimensional engagement platforms shaping and influencing the way citizens interact with one another. Domestic transactions and interactions are becoming dynamically smart and upwardly mobile with the emergence of new media, new thinking, new products, developmental and security issues. Unfortunately, access to internet and its critical resources is becoming a daunting task amid the nation's current security, economic and developmental challenges. Currently, Nigeria is faced with a huge youth populace, national integration challenges, as well as the rising waves of internal conflicts

NIGF 2013 thus sought to address these challenges by examining how these challenges are adversely affecting all stakeholders and all segments of the national socio-economy. The gathering realizes that no nation can move forward and progressively competitive in the current internet age if stakeholders failed to discussed the challenges without proffering steps that need to be taken. The edition took advantage of the multi-stakeholders nature of the Forum, opportunity for diverse open and inclusive national discourse to exchange ideas on Internet Governance for Empowerment, National Integration and Security via Multi-stakeholders Engagement.

The Forum has delivered on its mandate by providing opportunities for sharing information and experiences, generation of productive ideas and best practices that can help address our collective or common national challenges, as well as assisting in identifying key areas that could, in the future, benefit from the multi-stakeholder perspective of the NIGF. This is the rationale behind the formation of NIGF as envisioned by inter-agencies of government and stakeholders to provide vital sustainable advisory mechanism for Nigeria's position on internet governance and the basis for her participation in the West Africa, African and Global Internet Governance Fora.

The 2013 edition of the Forum has consolidated on the gains of NIGF 2012 as a motivating mechanism for annual gathering of stakeholders driven through multi-stakeholders partnership framework to dialogue on the internet governance. Currently, NIGF as an idea, has culminated into a reality by the formation of National Local Multi-Stakeholder Advisory Group (LMAG); successful convocation of the NIGF 2012 and 2013 editions; real life proactive engagement of more than 500 active participants; delivering opportunity to advance Internet Governance issues through a local multi-stakeholder framework. ; Furthermore, the facilitation of local partnerships and coalitions that deliver coordinated domestic response, initiatives; synergy that best promote and protect the nation's position on the internet ecosystem is not in doubt. To crown it all, Federal Government recognition and active participation through her agencies, regional recognition by West African IGF, to the Coordinated representation of Nigeria at the Global IGF all show and confirm that NIGF has a form and structure.

Once again, the Federal Ministry of Communication Technology, Nigerian Communications Commission (NCC), National Information Technology Development Agency (NITDA), Nigeria Internet Registration Association (NIRA), Internet Society (ISOC) and other domestic stakeholders have expressed their renewed commitment to making NIGF a formidable multi stakeholder platform, as well as facilitating partnerships for internet ecosystem in Nigeria.

Visit www.nigf.org.ng for more details.

Chapter Two

HIGHLIGHTS OF THE FORUM

2.1 Theme of NIGF 2013

The theme of the 2013 Forum is focused **"Internet Governance for Empowerment, National Integration and Security through Multi-stakeholders' Engagement"**.

2.2 The Specific Goal of the Forum

To stimulate, harmonize, and promote viable alternative opportunities for national empowerment, knowledge sharing, community integration, peaceful coexistence and security, towards our greater roles and responsibilities within the larger cyber ecosystem.

2.3 Forum General Objective

The objective of the Forum was to facilitate input of stakeholders national internet discourse, collation and articulation of contributions to internet governance from the civil societies, academia, security and law enforcement, government, law makers, industry, academia, and the general public in a manner that best promotes and protects the nation's position on the internet governance at the African and Global IGF Forum.

2.4 Forum Discussion Tracks

There were 3 general sessions and 6 parallel tracks covering the following:

   i.   Digital Inclusion and Integration,

ii.   Building Trust, Confidence, & Assurance on the Internet,

iii.   Policy and Regulatory Model for the Internet,

iv.   Encouraging Local Research on Internet Development in Nigeria,

v.   Addressing Critical Internet Resources and Infrastructure in the Cashless Society, Emerging Issues, Way Forward,

vi.   Special Workshop for the NIGF Youth on "Business Opportunity in the Internet Industry".

Please see the appendix pages for reference

2.5 Outcome of the Forum

The production of a Communiqué from suggestions and recommendations of stakeholders as shown in the section of the document dealing with observations and communiqué. . Furthermore, the 2013 edition Forum outcomes are posted on the NIGF website (http://www.nigf.org.ng) for general public knowledge and for further comments. In addition, the communiqué is posted to the individual participants and the website of the organizers respectively.

2.5 Forum Delegates & Attendance:

The Forum was attended by over 600 stakeholders from public institutions, private sector groups, civil societies, professional bodies, trade associations, academia, students and youths, military and para-military organizations, security and law enforcement agencies, government, law makers, ICT industry, internet users, and the public. Also in attendance were media groups from print, electronic and online media, scholars and research scientists. It was a one-day national dialogue and a preparatory meeting seeking various stakeholders' contributions towards the country's position on Internet Governance, and her participation at the forthcoming global IGF taking place on the 22 to 25 October 2013 in Bali, Indonesia.

The Forum was declared open by the Hon. Minister of Communication Technology, Mrs. Omobola Johnson, and chaired by Dr. Ernest Ndukwe (O.F.R) Co-Chairman Presidential Committee on Broadband and Chairman of Openmedia Communications Ltd. Over 50 active internet stakeholders spoke at the event, including high-ranking members of the public and private sector institutions whose actions, operations and services are critically revolve around the internet. The Minister of Communications Technology applauded the interagency collaboration and commended all the other stakeholders for organizing a unique multi-stakeholder forum for policy dialogue on issues of internet governance in Nigeria.

The Forum was well attended and participants expressed happiness with the way it was organized**. *(Please find the list of registered participants at the appendix page ii and iii)*

Hon. Minister of Comm. Tech with the Press after the NIGF 2013 execution session

Chapter Three
THE FORUM PROCEEDINGS

3.1. **Opening Session:** The program commenced with the called to order at about 9:30am. Introductions of eminent personalities, and brief welcome remarks were made by the Compere, Mr. Reuben Mouka, who is the Head of Media & Publicity (NCC). The Minister of Communications Technology, Mrs. Omobola Johnson who was the Special Guest led the Forum in the singing of the National Anthem.

i. **Welcome and Opening Remarks by Mrs. Mary Uduma –** Chairperson, Local Multi-Stakeholder Advisory Group and NIGF 2013 Planning Committee & President, Nigeria Internet Registration Association (NIRA).

The attention of the participants was drawn to the 2012 edition of NIGF when stakeholders reactivated process of harnessing the opportunities of Multi-Stakeholders nature of NIGF to help stimulate local participations, input and contributions to the regional and global internet governance discourse. This effort has helped the country in harmonizing her voice and consolidating her position which have earned the respects of regional and global IGF. It is expected that NIGF 2013 will facilitate emergence of viable alternatives and opportunities that best address the nation's most critical national and internet issues, while simultaneously promoting the nation's position at the Regional and Global IGF taking place on the 22 to 25 October 2013 in Bali, Indonesia. Nigeria now has formal national structures to coordinate her positions. NIGF is important to the United Nation's IGF Secretariat, and the outcome of NIGF reports will be shared at the international gatherings as the country contributions towards formulating global policy that will help shape the future engagement, and interactions in cyberspace.

The basis of establishing NIGF and the milestone achievement of NIGF since 2012 were highlighted, such included:

the formation of National *Local Multi-Stakeholder Advisory Group (LMAG),*

Federal Government recognition and active participation through her agencies, coordinated representation and participation at West African IGF, Africa IFG and the Global IGF in 2012

.

However, the challenges faced outside the shores of the country such as IP blockages, profiling of the internet traffic from Nigeria, rejection of online visa card issued from Nigeria, absence of the likes of Paypal, digital disenfranchisement and online security issues based on trust which were the major concerns of Nigerian stakeholders during the NIGF 2012 were presented at the global IGF 2012 at Baku.

The partnership from the DNS industry, Google, MTN, Etisalat, and the supports from the Ministry of Communication Technology, NITDA, NCC, NIRA and all other stakeholders were appreciated.

ii.   **Overview of IGF & the journey so far:** By Dr. Sylvanus Ehikioya, Director of Information Security & New Media, NCC

The IGF was established in 2006 at World Summit of Information Society (WSIS) was established as Multi-stakeholder discourse on policy and issues affecting internet, engaging the various ideas and best practices across the spectrum of stakeholders to discussed on the development of internet. The WSIS Resolution set the basis for IGF agenda and interactions across the globe, including Nigeria. NIGF is set up to provide opportunity for local contributions and input into forthcoming Global IGF in Bali, Indonesia. The NIGF 2012 resolutions were presented at regional and global levels. It has served as an input into the current development and some of the country initiatives expected to bring about new change in Nigeria.

iii. Special Remarks by Prof. Angaye, Director General of the National Information Technology Development Agency

The NITDA Act 2007 which established NITDA provides under section 6 (m) that NITDA shall accelerate Internet and Intranet Penetration in Nigeria and Promote Sound Internet Governance by giving effect to the second schedule of the NITDA ACT 2007. Since the first Global Internet Governance Forum (IGF) which took place in Athens in 2006, it is now an established fact that the management and development of the Internet requires not only a multi-stakeholder approach but also a multi-dimensional platform to tackle all the issues associated with its use. NITDA is prepared to collaborate with all stakeholders in exercising the mandate of sound Internet Governance.

The theme of NIGF 2013 covers the tripod issues relevant to the country towards achieving the national goals as contained in our transformation agenda. Over the past 7 years, the IGF has consistently provided a platform for industry stakeholders to map and contribute their expertise in the development of laws, regulations and policies affecting the Internet and its uses. Some of these contributions have led to multi-lingual World Wide Web and the opening up of top level domains. Critical issues such as network neutrality, cyber security, development, privacy, openness, diversity, and international cooperation as well as capacity building are still high on

> **"It is time to collaborate to achieve the common goals of nation building by breaking down the internal walls and build a better external wall for the country security, privacy and economic development"**

the agenda of Internet Governance discussions and only forums like this can provide an opportunity to measure the pulse of the Internet community especially as regards government policies.

Attention is drawn to multi-stakeholder engagement aspect of the theme. Engagement within this context means collaboration and cooperation instead of conflicts and turf battles. **It is time to collaborate to achieve the common goals of nation building by breaking down the internal walls and build a better external wall for the country security, privacy and economic development.**

iv. **Special Remarks by Dr. Eugene Ikemefuna Juwah, Executive Vice Chairman of Nigerian Communications Commission (NCC),** Represented by Dr. Sylvanus Ehikioya, Director of Information Security & New Media NCC

The Nigerian Communications Commission is enthusiastic of collaborating with stakeholders in championing the policies that shape the use and governance of the internet. It is expected that the forum will provide opportunities for the stakeholders to actively participate and contribute to the development of internet. Stakeholder should engage the rare privilege offered by the NIGF to provide useful input towards the country harmonized position at the IGF.

v. **Special Remarks by Engr. Lanre Ajayi, President, Association of Telecom Companies of Nigeria (ATCON).**
The Forum is organized at the crucial time when there have been increased interest and contest in the management and the control of the internet between the ITU and the ICANN, as well as the emerging transformation of internet and increase in the hundreds of top level domain names. NIGF therefore present a great opportunity to reflect on these issues, aggregate opinions and articulate stakeholders positions that can help provide advice at the global level.

vi. **Special Remarks by Alh L.O.T Shittu, Director General of Nigeria Governors' Forum**

The Nigeria Governors' Forum is building collaboration with Nigerian Internet Registration Association (NIRA) on internet penetrations along a secure structure and a framework to ensure every citizen enjoys the benefit of internet. Stakeholders should learn from the Forum productive ideas, best practices, experiences and opportunities that would be discussed for the benefit of the country.

vii. Special Remarks by the President, Nigeria Computer Society Represented by Mr. Chinedu Onuoha

The country is confronted by security and unemployment issues which are interrelated. The forum attention is drawn to the issues of mass unemployment while the participants were challenged to make input on how internet can be used productively harnessed to empower the unemployed through multi-stakeholder engagement and collaboration.

viii. Keynote Address by Mrs. Omobola Johnson, Hon. Minister, Communication Technology

The pace of growth on the internet is truly remarkable; between 2000 and 2012, the number of Africans that use the Internet has grown by over 3,000%. In 2012, 33% of the World's population was estimated to be using the Internet including 13.5% of people living in Africa. In 2013, these numbers have increased to 34.3% of people worldwide, including 15.6% of people living in Africa. In real times, this 1% point increase of Africans using the Internet equates to an additional 26 million people.

Nigeria have seen the number of Internet users rise from 45 million in December 2011, to 48 million in June 2012, i.e 3 million new users in just six months. Figures from the four major operators (MTN, GLO, Airtel and Etisalat) tell the same story; as at June 2012 total mobile Internet subscription stood at about 25 million, by March 2013 an additional 9 million new

subscribers had been added bringing the total to 34 million. These figures are highlighted to bring to the fore the scale of what participants will be discussing in NIG Forum, as well as bring into context issues that will be discussed in Bali in October.

(Please see the appendix page for the full text of the Minister's Speech)

ix. **Presentation of the Forum Distinguished Paper ''Addressing the Vulnerability of Critical ICT Infrastructure'' By the Chairman of theForum, Dr Ernest Ndukwe (O.F.R) Co-Chairman Presidential Committee on Broadband and Chairman of OpenMedia Communications Ltd**

Critical ICT Infrastructure for Nigeria in the new Nigerian National Broadband plan is defined as *ICT networks and systems that are crucial to the Federal Republic of Nigeria to the extent that the damage, destruction or ineffectiveness of such networks and systems, whether physical or virtual, would have adverse impact on national security, economic wellbeing, public safety, food security or any combination thereof.* It acts as a vital cross-sector dependency linkage between critical infrastructures. There are Cyber-attacks and Physical attacks. ICT infrastructures have recently been subjected to physical damages all over the country, i.e. cutting of submarine fibre cables, cut to intra-city and interstate fibre cables, criminal disruption of services, cable theft and terrorist attacks. However all over the world, cyber threats continue to grow and constitute major national security vulnerability points. It must therefore be the intention of every government in the digital age to maintain a cyber-environment that encourages economic prosperity while promoting business efficiency, innovation, safety, security and confidentiality. It is therefore essential that government urgently enacts comprehensive Cybersecurity Laws to address the liability and criminal risks that may originate from inappropriate use of internet infrastructure, need for

International coordination, exchange of intelligence, training and manpower development of subject matter experts, while ensuring that operators of Critical Infrastructure protect their systems from harm. It does not really matter whether critical infrastructure is lost or disrupted due to terrorism, bad planning or deterioration. What is essential is to develop a long-term infrastructure vulnerability mitigation strategy with close collaboration between government and the operators, in order to address infrastructure design, protection and upgrades. This issue needs to rise to the level of a national agenda and given high priority status by all stakeholders.

(Please download full copy of the presentation from www.nigf.org.ng)

Questions from Participants:

CEO, Silicon Valley: *How can the country become producer and supplier of broadband products (through a roadmap) such as fiber optics cable within the framework of National Broadband Policy in order to prevent capital flight?*

Adeyemo Adekola from CBN: *(Comment) Cognizance should be given to logical attack such as virus attack and it should be given national priority*

Dr I. *A. Gwuso,* *Faculty of Law, University of Ilorin: What is Government doing towards having a legal framework to address the cybercrime in Nigeria?*

Chairman's Response:
The issue has always been one of the critical subject matter to the government. The major hindrance to manufacturing plants in Nigeria is electricity. Once the electricity is stable Nigerians will naturally respond to the manufacturing needs of the country. Government is also currently addressing these issues through effort of the present Minister of Communication Technology. The subject matter of logical attack has been treated under the subject matter of Cybersecurity. It is assumed that the Cybersecurity is encompasses solutions to all threats including the logical

attack. The current administration is working on the Cybersecurity bill, and it is expected that the law makers will expedite legislative actions as a matter of national urgency.

Input from the Director General, Ekiti State Information Technology Development Agency emphasized the important role of states government and states legislative actions on cybercrime bill. He reiterated that states law makers can begin the process of making laws in their various states on data protections, Cybersecurity and cybercrime if the federal law makers' actions on Cybersecurity bill are delayed.

Mr. Olayinka Adejube, Acting Head ITSS Dept. NITDA offered vote of thanks

From left to Right:

- *The Forum Chairman, Dr. Ernest Ndukwe (O.F.R) presenting NIGF gift to the Hon. Min of Comm. Tech in the presence of Mrs. Mary Uduma, the Chairperson of NIGF LMAG.*

- *Mrs. Mary Uduma, the Chairperson of NIGF LMAG granting press interview shortly after the NIGF 2013 opening session*

Chapter Four

OVERVIEW OF CONCURRENT TRACK SESSIONS

Agenda/Tracks	Preliminary Information
Encouraging Local Research on Internet Development In Nigeria	Agenda 1 is proposed to help stimulate dialogue on the critical imperative of local Internet Research as against the foreign ones which usually are ignorant of our operating environment. The need to generate internal statistical data on various aspect of internet development in the country for planning and key decision making
Digital Inclusion And Integration	With the spate of terror attack and the emergency rule in the Northern part of the Country, communities operating within the attacked areas will be denied critical access to internet community in the most devastating ways. In some instances there are outright disconnections with inability to communicate from or with region under attack. The escalating digital exclusion is becoming a threat to internet penetration and inclusion in the information society. Participants will examine various ways stakeholders can overcome problem of community digital exclusion.
Building Trust, Confidence, & Assurance on the Internet	*Trust* is the basis of 3 framework of security in a connected community. The confidentiality and integrity of interactions, and availability of the means of interactions within the internet ecosystem is vital towards building Confidence and Assurance among the stakeholders. The participants will be looking into various available strategies and key policy areas critical to the protection and privacy right of

stakeholders.

Policy and Regulatory Model for the Internet

Nobody owns internet. Nevertheless, countries are taking proactive steps and implementing initiatives to protect digital wealth and mitigate adverse use or abuse of the internet through regulatory policies. How can regulatory policies be implemented without inhibiting innovation, privacy rights, openness and inclusive nature of the internet? Participants will cooperatively discuss this area with a view to proffer suggestions to government and other key players.

Addressing Critical Internet Resources and Infrastructure in the Cashless Society

The success and sustainability of e-payment and mobile money regime is critically dependent upon a robust infrastructure such as power, fiber optics driven broadband, and engagement of critical internet resources. Massive investments in power sector should commensurate the internet infrastructure deployment.

Emerging Issues.

The participants will be discussing emerging issue such as Child Online Protection & Sexual Exploitation, Cloud Security, Internet Surveillance, Internet for Agricultures, Smart & Mobile Internet, Local Internet Content. These issues will keep policy makers abreast of the dynamism of internet ecosystem, impact on government, people, development, economy, security and youths.

New Media Special Training Workshop

This is a special session exposing youths to internet driven business opportunities that can be easily harnessed. This

for youths, businesses and the press	session is primarily business focused, and training on interaction. It is expected to empower participants with relevant information for instant start-up business engagement.

All track sessions started concurrently at 12:10pm with the moderators explaining the topics and requested that the group discussions should focus mainly on viable solutions.

TRACK ONE | Encouraging Local Research on Internet Development   in Nigeria
Moderator: Dr. Akin Fapohunda, Director Alfon Digital Institute.

Key Discussion Points:

- Thinking of how the internet can become a local Nigerian culture and ways of life
- Imperative of undertaking local research towards understanding the foundation and application of internet
- Evolving solutions and strategy towards making progress in internet research and development
- Harmonizing all contributions towards making input into NIGF 2013 resolutions

Discussions Panel:

Gbenga Sesan: CEO Paradigm Initiative Nigeria

- Nigerian academia should be the vanguard of local Internet research and to a larger extent, ICT research and development. There is strategic imperative for the local ICT Industry to support the academia through effective collaboration. University must impress upon their final year students to engage their thesis on internet research. The effort should be encouraged by the stakeholders. There must be local research basis for the implementation of Cybersecurity law. Policy making must be driven by research rather than assumption.

Need for the establishment of Internet Utilization Center in the Nigerian Universities proposed to the representative of National Bureau of Statistics (NBS) where students can learn and engage in internet research in practical reality.

Biyi Fabunmi, Representative of The National Bureau of Statistic (NBS)

NBS is the national coordinator of government statistical data. NBS has transformed its operations through the application ICT. There is an expository on the usage of ICT by NBS, most specifically data capturing system to help collate and aggregate collected data.

Interjection by the Moderator: It is imperative for NBS to partner with Nigeria Universities on data collection and experimental analysis of research data through the engagement of post graduate students. This is an essential focal point for the Forum resolution.

Peter Olu Jack: President Rose Mary Taribi Foundation

There is proposition for the creation of Community Enterprise Hub which serves as hub for the existing and emerging community telecenters. This is strategic towards achieving internet penetration in the country. It is important for NIGCOMSAT to provide its capacity to support these telecenters through a commercial engagement and partnership framework. The presence of the centers will further enhance local capacity to capture and generate data for local internet research in the country.

Dr. Vincent Olatunji, Strategic Planning and Research department, NITDA: Represented

NITDA has been at the forefront of awareness on web presence and internet utilization among government institutions and agencies. NITDA has embarked on various ICT developments in the country using local consultants for baseline studies. The outcome of such studies has contributed greatly to the ICT project decision making. The major challenge is in identifying the country's ICT requirements or weaknesses. With the

proliferation of digital and mobile devices in the country, the issue of identity of local users of these devices has become imperative to data capturing and processing and this is crucial to local internet research development.

Suggestions from the Moderator: NBS and NITDA should collaborate towards carrying out a research on ICT facilities availability in the country considering the efforts of USPF, MTN and similar organizations' effort of empowering schools in Nigeria.

Contributions from the Participants

- Unnamed Participant: Emphasis should be placed on effective local participation in the Internet Research, which entailed studying, understanding and participating in the internet research, as well community focused tele center should be encouraged.
- *Commissioner of Science & Technology Niger State*: Three Key issues must be address before embarking on internet research. i) availability of reliable database on the researchers in Nigeria, ii) identification of national priority that will help define areas of concentration in our quest for internet research, and iii) funding and capacity development i.e source of research funding, institutionalization of research outcome, identification of viable drivers of internet research in the country.
- *Tope Soremi NGO*: Within the context of National priority, states need to define own areas of priorities, while drawing funding primarily from states academic institutions to create a real value chain. Value chain cannot be created depending on the external sources. External sources have different insights to research and therefore cannot satisfy the planning needs of the local institutions.
- *Michael Oke, Agric-link Mutlipurpose cooperative society:* Need to identify those that will support internet research in terms of funding and institutionalizing the outcome.
- *Peter Jack:* Research is driven by practical innovation and the need to identify reality.

- Gbenga Sesan: There is funding opportunity but NITDA need to respond positively to the yearning of internet research support in the country.
- NITDA representative: NITDA has fund set aside for funding research or grants and take ownership of the research data and the result. NITDA makes outcome of the research available to stakeholders.

General Remarks:

- Ownership of research data is key to researchers, and possibility of synergy between the industry, private researchers and academia. .
- Policy making should be strictly based on research facts and not assumptions.
- There is a fundamental disconnect between the Government and the research community.
- NITDA should collaborate with NBS to create a directory of ICT infrastructure and personnel available in the country and the project should be carried out in every 2 years intervals.
- NITDA should collaborate with NBS to produce the status of Internet utilization or users in Nigeria.
- Each State/institution should make policies that will force/enhance the usage of Internet in their respective States.
- Need for a network that connects the government, academia and research community.
- Need for the creation of an open data system for researchers to access as well as creating synergy between end users and the researchers.

Moderator Final Remark:

The topic discussed is simply how to use research to make internet popular and become part of our existence. Following submissions were made;

- There is need to renew linkages between the industry and the research community (academia).
- We need to identify national problem in specific terms and to study common problem with contributions from all stakeholders.

- NITDA and NBS should collaborate in providing credible data that can be made available through NITDA's website for researchers to access.
- Implementation of practical ideas rather than theoretical idea.
- Community involvement through IT centres and Tele-centres.

TRACK TWO | Access, Diversity, Digital Inclusion & Integration
Moderator: Prof. Chidi Odinkanlu, Chairman National Human Right Commission

The moderator re-emphasized on the scope and basis of discussions. The escalating digital literacy and exclusion are becoming a threat towards internet penetration and digital citizenship. Participants were inspired to examine various ways stakeholders can overcome problem of community digital exclusion and digital literacy. There is challenge of digital literacy. There is more micro digital capability in the hands of the people in form of digital and mobile devices than the ability to engage such capability actively for productive means. This is a digital literacy gap. The poor school enrolment most especially in the northern part of the country is not a good pointer towards developing digital literacy and capability. Literacy is a prerequisite for digital citizenship.

Key Discussion Points:

- Digital literacy and digital citizenship
- Addressing the challenges of Digital exclusion
- Identifying critical challenges militating against internet access
- Digital inclusion for the vulnerable groups and grassroots.
- Examining various ideas, solutions and opportunities that can be harnessed
- Harmonizing various contributions

Discussions Panel:

- Dr. Wunmi Hassan; President/CEO, High-Tech Centre for Nigerian Youths and Women

- Jerry Bent; Rep. from Nation Orientation Agency
- Mr. Ken Ugbechie, Chairman, Business & Tech News Publishers Foundation
- Mr. Oluseyi Soremekun, UNESCO
- Mr. Kalu Ndukwe, Representative, Vulnerable Group (Youth, Women, and Challenged Group).

General Remark

Digital inclusion is a necessity to national development and it is beneficial to the country by enhancing citizenship integration, global competiveness, government revenues, national integrity, and human development and skills, thus promote a positive change.

The participants reached on the general consensus by enumerating various challenges to include: Lack of Political commitment and will; Inadequate legal and policy environment; Absence of the right value system where awareness in digital ethics for all participants is promoted; Literacy and Capacity building in ICT for teachers, parents and all and Enforcement of educational policy that integrates ICT into school curricula.

UNESCO-Nokia International experience was examined where they currently developed digital literacy content on mobile application which would also contribute towards enhancing digital inclusion and capability in the informal sector.

All the participants further reiterated the need for an effective new policy and legal framework that will include the following stakeholders' participation, data protection, digital independence, adequate infrastructural framework which also relates to literacy, as well as government intervention to bridge the digital divide among the disconnected and disparate entities in the country.

There was a consensus that there is need for a change in attitude. The issues of access, use, skills, right partnerships, data interface, rather than the promotion of data silos, should be tackled.

The critical need for a central data base was reiterated. Furthermore, the issues of a proper documentation of the population by creating effective data capturing through

base institutions such as hospitals, schools, and places of worship were highlighted. This should evolve into a harmonized method of including all citizens, particularly, women, youths, migrant communities, the physically challenged, et cetera. The regulatory framework needs to be addressed to streamline the institutions involved, and their baseline responsibilities.

The country cannot have digital inclusion without digital independence as a nation. In the current definition of sovereignty, nations that are not technologically sovereign are not considered sovereign.

There should be integration of Local Area Network in the planning and building of the state to promote digital inclusion and easy access to internet from homes. Rural Community IT training centers should be built by government to create grassroots' IT capacity for the rural dwellers. They should be included in the overall national IT planning. Government should make digital inclusion facility available and possible to the physically challenged group in the country. Strategy should be evolved to enforce policy on digital inclusion.

TRACK THREE | Building Trust, Confidence, & Assurance on the Internet
MODERATOR: Dr. Sylvanus Ehikioya (Dir New Media & Info NCC)

The moderator highlighted the main focus of discussion on Security and Trust on the Internet. The goals are centered on the "things to put in place as to enable trust on the Internet".

Key Discussion Points:

- Examining the Issues of Trust and Security
- Developing policy, guidelines and enabling laws
- Access to un hindrance services
- Addressing the issues of vulnerability
- Examining basis for fraud and issues of greediness
- Imperative of National database

- Critical position of Information sharing
- IT Experts roles decision making, policies and laws
- Framework for adoption of security technology

Discussions Panel:

- Mr. Olayinka Adejube
- Mr. Ahmed Saad Rep NSA Office
- Mr. Bolaji Olaitan Arogun – Data Sec Analyst – Cybaron (USA)
- Mr. Hakeem Ajijola – Chairman – CS2 (CERT ECO-SYS)
- Mr Dele Ajisomo – MD/CEO – OSFON

CS2 (CERT ECO-SYS): **Presentation on Implementation of Cert.Ng Ecosystem**

The presentation covers the areas of data security, the ownership and that no sector should own or dominate the system such as the implementation and operation of Computer Emergency Response Team exclusively. There is need to build an ecosystem that will address sectorial, organizational, and individual security needs. Stakeholder's involvement is a key to building the system and trust. NITDA has set up plans and engage staff to work out modalities and implementation strategies in implementing CERT in Nigeria. The results of the activities of CERT are to raise awareness, set up incident response, requisite infrastructure, building capacity amongst others e.g through the honeynet project, and also the web Assurance Certification Framework.

Mr Dele Ajisomo – MD/CEO – OSFON

Security is the responsibility of everyone. How can security be provided and the issues of online trust be dealt with? Public key infrastructure recently be launched can provide a framework for digital trust and NIMC is working on unified national identity structure. These two projects will provide the nation with solutions to online trust.

President of ISACA

Government should develop and enforce Information Technology Security Due Care and Due Diligence before deployment of IT infrastructure in the country. Furthermore, there be should development of industrial CERT and legal framework for such system to work. Existing law could be amended to address cybercrime and cybersecurity issues. There should be adoption of IT governance framework to help regulate the operations of users of IT either in public or private sectors. DNS security framework should be built. DNS stakeholders such as NIRA, NITDA and others. Others areas that should be considered for global discussion are; Wireless Protocol Gap between the IT system and Telecom system where is the Middleware which handles protocol back and forth which could be exploited by the hackers; Personal Identifiable Information relating to identity theft framework. The two sides of IT i.e. functionality and security should always reflect on the minds of planners and decision makers.

Mr. Hakeem Ajijola – Chairman –

Ahmed Saad of the NSA Office expressed the need for the country to articulate her cyber activities as well as making information/data uniform and accurate. He proposed for the creation of National Database and National CERT for the coordination of digital security in the country. The CS2 called for stakeholders engagement in implementing all activities articulated from this forum.

Contributions from the Participants

IT Special Adviser to Sokoto State Governor

There should be synergy among all the government agencies and various active players from private sector. State of emergency should be declared in IT in the country to address seemingly non budgetary allocations required for the funding IT and priority given to IT project in the national budget.

GENERAL REMARKS

- Awareness information should be made available to the public on internet security and identity theft crisis, responsible engagement on the internet.

- Transparency is key in achieving trust and data management in Nigeria. Security must be the responsibility of all stakeholders.

- Forensic experts should be engaged in the planning, development and implementation of IT project to help identify areas of vulnerability or structural weakness which could be exploited by the hackers.

- NCC is building a framework for website security assurance in the country in collaboration with NITDA.

- Periodic review of the country Internet Laws and policy as to keep up with technological growth.

- The country must build local trust through local entrepreneur engagement to enthroned confidence in the local business transactions which will help address the problem of denial of services from international community. This is critically needful before we could attract same from International communities.

- Need to develop a National database that will address and eliminate all the fears on online services and transactions.

There is need to build a proper multi-stakeholders collaboration and engagement in internet security in order to achieve the collective target on security issues and improve on our image in terms of trust, openness and privacy locally and internationally.

TRACK FOUR: Understanding Internet Infrastructural - Policy &Regulatory Model for the Internet

Moderator: Engr. Titi Omo-Ettu, Managing Partner – Telecom Answers Associate

The country should avoid overregulation of the industry as well as the internet. This is because it has implicating effect on the industry. Over-regulation is induced by fear of unknown which may lead to over specifications beyond the level people can go. This can lead to policy reversal. Overregulation is also a result of uninformed mind of decision makers. Education of the country regulators is essentially critical and imperative because they must be well informed above the industry rather than the vice-visa. However, limited regulation is essential for the country.

Key Discussion Points:

Discussions Panelist:
Bar. Emeka Obigeolu   -   National Secretary, Nigeria Bar Association

Mr. **Emmanuel Edet** Legal & Board Affairs, NITDA
Government primary responsibility is to protect the integrity of the nation and her people under her sovereignty, while the major interest of the industry is to use resources to maximize profit. Government laws are meant to protect herself and the industry. How can we ensure security without tampering with privacy in order to handle criminal violations of laws? These are areas of contentions.

Eng. Ahmed Maska - Director, Compliance and Monitoring, NCC

Policy making in the areas of regulation should be mindful of overall impact across the nation. There is need for a limited regulation policy framework for the internet for the purpose of the integrity and safe use of the internet for any intended purpose.

Engr. Lanre Ajayi - President ATCON
The successes recorded in the internet are due to effective formulation of policy and management most specifically from ICANN point of view. Regulation of internet and policy formulation should involve multi stakeholders' equal engagement where all stakeholders have equal rights to participate in the internet regulatory policy development.

Interjection by the Moderator.

The attempt by the ITU to take over the regulation and management of internet should be the concerns of all participants in NIGF 2013. Stakeholders should provide a strong and make our positions known at the global forum. All stakeholders must have equal input into the governance of internet.

General Remarks

- Company policies or guidelines should not be compared with the Act of the parliament on cybercrime. It cannot achieve the overall regulations and protection privacy rights in the country.
- Stakeholder should always be consulted and engaged in the process of formulating regulatory policy.
- In order to avoid anarchy in the industry there must be regulation
- Regulation is about protection, and there are three levels of protection; government is protecting her integrity, industry is protection her profit, stakeholder is their usage, resources and information. Regulation is all about interplay of interests at the level of Government, the Industry and the Users. It is generally agreed that regulation is desirable; however, regulation must ensure a level playing ground and the protection of all interests.
- It is recognized that over regulation is a manifestation of fear and fear can only be removed through knowledge; therefore, continuous Capacity Development for regulators is critically imperative.
- Government should not think that regulatory responsibilities starts and ends with it, therefore all levels of regulations must involve all stakeholders.
- Regulations of contents should build on existing infrastructure regulatory models/platforms.
- The session noted with dismay that the Cyber Security Bill has been at the National Assembly for several years and request that the National Assembly passes it into Law without delay.

- Broadcasting Industry players were not present in the Track and if that situation cuts across all tracks, the omission should be corrected.

TRACK FIVE: Addressing Critical Internet Resources and Infrastructure in the Cashless Society

Moderator: Mr. Fatokun Director of Bank Operation & e-payment

The success and sustainability of e-payment and cashless mobile money regime is critically dependent upon a robust infrastructure such as power, fiber optics driven broadband, and engagement of the critical internet resources. What are the challenges? How can the country overcome these challenges?

Key Point of Discussions

- Issue of Critical Connectivity as it relates to the cashless policy of CBN
- Funding of Internet connectivity Infrastructure
- Role of Government and key Stakeholders
- Security of Infrastructure
- Harmonizing stakeholders input

Discussion Panel

Mohammed Rudman: CEO Nigeria Internet Exchange Point/Director NIRA

The country interconnectivity has real challenging issues. Most of the time, the POS is riding on GSM network. The GSM networks are already congested because the same channels are used for voice and data. Because they make their profit from the voice traffic, their priority is on voice traffic. If the POS terminal is connected to a cell site

which is also connected to Nigeria Interbank Settlement System for Transactions and simultaneously if lot of people are making phone calls at the same time, it means therefore data traffic that has lower prioritization in their network will not have access to the network. Furthermore, there are lots of people not connected to broadband rather through their GSM network which unfortunately cannot do much in terms quality of service delivery. Fiber optic transmission line could have been a better alternative channel but unfortunately it is hugely expensive. Government should get involved and provide fiber optic transmission lines throughout the country. There is need to developed intervention fund to lower the cost of the internet across the country so that people can engage online. There should be more internet service providers to provide more internet connectivity so that the POS terminal or ATM would no longer ride on GSM network but ride on the ISP network in secure way to have access to online transactions. The whole focus should be on customers, because if we are able to provide business online, we should be able to attract participation from customers. If the access to such online businesses is expensive we cannot have a cashless society.

Mr. Biyi Oladipo: Board member/Treasurer of NIRA

One of the major challenges of critical infrastructures is the problem of distributive network, however the issues of gateways has been solved to some extent, for example, there are Main one cable, GLO One, Sat 3 and Google much expected satellite launch. How can the country benefit from the cables that have landed? It is through finding solution to the distributive network challenges through provision of fiber optic. However, Government should not get involved in the funding in order to avoid bottleneck. Rather, Government should provide incentives to the people who would be interested in investing in the infrastructure, and most especially in the areas of Right of Way which has been a major issue. Government can establish an entity to administer the Right of Way problems in all the states. Transaction security issues are another major problem because people do not have confidence on the security of their online transactions. However NIRA is working hard to ensure security and prevention of online downtime.

Physical security of fiber optic is a major source of concern which must be proactively addressed.

Chief Toye Olanipekun, DG Ekiti State ICT Agency

It is expected that the broadband policy has designated 1.5mb/per for the definition of broadband. The security of the wireless cashless infrastructure should be addressed through cryptographic security framework or digital signature infrastructure. The Trust issues should be closely addressed at inter-connectivity level.

Interjection from the Moderator

How can we ensure security of the environment under which CBN mobile money is expected to operate?

Mr. Kola Adeyemo CBN

There is standardized security framework and applications that been deployed towards solving the problem of cross platform security issues among all the devices and at different interconnectivity layers. The application is depending on Payment Application Device Security System (PADSS) and Java driven security system which depends on the high end users. The CBN emphasized on the application that focused on ordinary user in order to engender financial inclusion.

CEO Silicon Valley:

The GSM operators should be directed to upgrade their voice infrastructure network to the network that can carry both voice and data. CBN should invest in the local manufacturing of fiber optics to prevent capital flight.

General Contributions/Remarks

- Representative of Pencom, CBN has greater role to play in the infrastructure investment funding intervention as similarly done in the airline sector. CBN should finance investment in cashless payment infrastructures.

- MainOne cable representative: People should be made to know where fiber optics infrastructure is laid so they can invest within that particular areas. Representative from Mainone cable, community participation in the management of right of way is crucial solely for the security and protection of the infrastructures.
- Olufemi Olumuyiwa:; Alternatively since fiber optics infrastructure is expensive, Government should make Nigcomsat satellite gateway work. Nigcomsat should be able to provide the country with gateway satellite infrastructure in addition to the one being provided by the others.
- Chris Anyanwu from OK Computers: Within the context of all these discussions what are the CBN doing to secure ordinary users when considering the challenges of disconnected services experienced at ATM stations?
- CBN should carry out literacy awareness on the importance of the e-payment services at grassroots level. Many people living in these remote areas are ignorant of the operations of cashless society being canvassed for by the CBN.
- CBN should look into the cost of operating online transactions. The process is costly and effort should be made to reduce the cost of setting up online transaction payment system.
- The engagement of power lines of PHCN for network connectivity in the country should be looked into and critically considered to solve the problem of network distribution since PHCN has more than 80% power line infrastructure.
- CBN should considered partnership with local ISPs in order to solve the issues network connectivity.
- Government should designate specific secure areas in the country for the laying of infrastructural cables.
- We should avoid mixing cashless idea with mobile money idea. Mobile money is an innovation issue and it is not financial transaction issue. CBN cannot approached mobile issues from the banking perspective without key consideration of technology innovation required to make it work. Telecom industry is more positioned to do the innovation than the bank because banks are burdened with overwhelming regulations which have override their ability to

concentrate and cannot allow them to get involved successfully in the innovation required in the mobile money. We should retrace our steps by allowing telecom industry to get involved in the mobile money innovation.

- Nigeria has fiber cable infrastructures on ground which runs across the major cities in the country. Cost of Right of Ways, issues of vandalism contributed majorly to the high cost of services.

- The nature of government intervention fund is such that can subsidize the local internet access via fiber optic transmission. This will enhance internet penetration, encourage economy of scale, and greater utilization of fiber optic infrastructures which will reduced cost ultimately.

- CBN and banks should localize their internet traffic by hosting their services locally to addresses security issues as result of lawful interception from another country where traffic passes through.

- Cashless economy cannot be achieved without a robust and pervasive infrastructure backbone. Therefore government should mobilized telecom operators, Ministries of Works, Power and core stakeholders to come together and established Infrastructure Company as special purpose vehicle that will manage the nation telecom infrastructure through a public-private partnership framework.

TRACK SIX | Emerging Issues *Plenary (General) Session Moderator: Dr. Ernest Ndukwe (O.F.R) –The Forum Chairman*

The participants discussed the emerging issues covering: Child Online Protection & Sexual Exploitation; Cloud Security, Internet Surveillance; Internet for Agricultures; Smart & Mobile Internet; and Local internet content. These issues are expected to keep policy makers abreast of the dynamism of internet ecosystem, the emerging new roles of government in internet development, digital economy, security and youth's re-engagement.

Key Discussion Points

- Examination of various key indicators for Value Chain Impact
- Harmonization of various views expressed towards preparing a national position at the global IGF 2013 in Bali, Indonesia
- Emerging new roles of government in internet development for economy empowerment.
- Roles of Stakeholders and the Industry

Discussion Panel

General Remarks
TRACK SEVEN | Way Forward
Moderator: Mr. S.L. Akinnusi

Coordination of moderators' submissions and consideration of the resolutions of all the track sessions with further input from the stakeholders.

Submissions:
Track 1: Gbenga Sesan (CEO Paradigm Initiative Nigeria) - Encouraging Local Research on Internet Development in Nigeria

- There should be renewed linkages between the industry and the research community (academia). This will foster internet research and funding.
- The country needs to identify her national problem in specific terms and to study her problem with contributions from all stakeholders.
- National Information Technology Development Agency (NITDA) and National Bureau of Statistic (NBS) should actively collaborate in providing credible data that can be made available through NITDA's website for internet researchers.
- There is need to implement practical ideas on internet development rather than theoretical idea. Local researchers should engage in the local internet research rather than depending on the foreign counterpart.

- Stakeholders and government efforts on tele-centres initiatives with community involvement should be encouraged.

Track 2: Dr. (Mrs.) Wunmi Hassan – Digital Inclusion & Integration

- Digital inclusion is a necessity to our development with many advantages such as enhancing citizenship, global competiveness, government revenues, national integrity, human development and skills and therefore a positive thing to promote.

- The following challenges identified include the following: lack of political commitment and will; inadequate legal and policy environment; absence of the right value system where awareness in digital ethics for all participants is promoted; literacy and capacity building in ICT for teachers, parents; and enforcement of educational policy that integrates ICT into school curricula

- The following are the proposed policy framework that should be due consideration; Stakeholders' active participation at all levels, digital independence for the country, Adequate infrastructural framework which also relates to literacy and Government intervention to bridge the digital divide

- There was a consensus that there is need for a change in attitude among all the stakeholders in the country. The issues of access, use, skills, right partnerships, legal framework, data interface (rather than the promotion of data silos) should be tackled and brought to the attention of the global IGF.

- The need for a central data base was reiterated. Also, the issues of a proper documentation of the population by creating effective data capturing through base institutions such as: Hospitals, School, and Places of worship.

- This is expected to progress into a harmonized method of including all citizens, particularly, women, youths, migrant communities, the physically challenged, et cetera into the database of the country.

- The regulatory framework needs to be addressed to streamline the institutions involved, and their baseline responsibilities.

- The country cannot have digital inclusion without digital independence as a nation. In the current definition of sovereignty, nations that are not technologically sovereign are not considered sovereign.

Track 3: Dr. Sylvanus Ehikioya – Building Trust, Confidence, & Assurance on the Internet.
- There is need to articulate our cyber activities as well as making information/data uniform and accurate.

- There is need to have stakeholders involvement in implementing all activities articulated from this forum.

- There is need to declare state of emergency on IT implementation

- There is need to enforce security on internet infrastructures

- There is need to have National Computer Emergency Response Team (CERT) and Individual CERT with central coordination from the office of National Security.

- There is need to have a proper legal framework and standards that will cover information assets and IT delivery services respectively.

- There is need to put into place an IT Governance framework that will drive the development of Internet in Nigeria.

- There is need to have a legal framework that will protect our personal sensitive data.

- Need to involve IT personnel as well as Forensic experts in making and carrying out Laws and policies for Internet security development.

- Emergent need to develop Internet capacity in order to embrace international best practices

- Transparency is key in achieving trust and data management in Nigeria.

- There is need for continuous review of our Internet Laws and policy to keep up with technological growth.

- There is need to embrace trust from home before we could attract same from International communities.

- Need to develop a National database that will address and eliminate all the fears on online services and transactions.

- There is need to build a proper multi-stakeholders collaboration towards achieving the collective target i.e to achieve a secure internet infrastructure, and improve on our image in terms of trust, openness and privacy.

Track 4 - *Engr. Titi Omo-Ettu – Moderator, Policy & Regulatory Model for the Internet*

- Noted with dismay non-passage of Cyber Security Bill by the law makers, and therefore request that the National Assembly passes it into Law without delay.
- Broadcasting Industry players should participate in the future NIGF.
- Regulation is interplay of interests at the levels of Government, the Industry and the Users. Therefore regulation is desirable and should ensure a level playing ground and the protection of all interests.
- Continuous capacity development for regulators is highly desirable and recommended to foster knowledge and harmony in the industry, and to eliminate fear of unknown or uncertainty.
- All levels of regulatory responsibilities must involve all stakeholders.

- Regulations of contents should build on existing infrastructure regulatory models/platforms.

Track 5: Mr. Kola Adeyemo: Addressing Critical Internet Resource & Infrastructure in the Cashless Society

- Government should provide incentive to the providers of internet service. Such incentive should include, uninterrupted power supply i.e electricity and provision of fiber optics.
- There should be stakeholder engagement in the provision of right of ways and security of infrastructure. i.e. government, private sector, law enforcement and the community should be actively involved in the security.
- Telecom operators should upgrade their base stations while expanding their functionalities in order to accommodate the ever increase demand.
- Powerline cable connectivity should be explored as an additional option towards improving local distributive network connectivity.
- Government should consider ICT infrastructure as part national emergency response strategy
- There should be separation between the voice and data distributive network, therefore there is need for the provision of 4th generation of broadband technology infrastructure to specifically address this challenge.
- Central Bank of Nigeria (CBN) should provide funding intervention similar to the one provided for airlines and collaborate with local service providers to help alleviate connectivity challenges and reduced costs.

Track 6: Mr. A.A. Akinbo - Youth Workshop
- Consistent stakeholder's training towards educating, orienting and empowering unused values and needs the strata.
- Cybersecurity bill need to be supported so that the actions and projects of Nigeria can be accepted worldwide.

- NIGF should set-up a committee for the establishment of national resource center in collaboration with other social corporate bodies to serve as telecenter where every average Nigerian can access internet and engage in productive activities through open access and open knowledge
- The NIGF should extend number of days for more viable discussions and engagement of youth in the future. The allotted time for the youth workshop was not adequate considering the large turnout of youth and the extent of the workshop.

  (Please Note: the youth workshop presentation papers are downloadable from www.nigf.org.ng)

Way Forward Session

General Remarks / Contributions from the Forum delegates
- NCC, NITDA and NERC should collaborate to ensure ICT security is integrated into the National Education Policy.
- There should be synergy between NITDA, NCC, Law makers and stakeholder on cybercrime bill legislation. Law makers should be invited into the future NIGF.
- There should government measure on child protection and prevention of child abuse through the use computers and internet.
- NIGF should be organized for three days when considering the enormous areas of discussions. There be should youth internet club to promote knowledge on the appropriate use of internet.
- NIGF should develop action plan and multi-partnership deliverable framework which should addressed the disable group, state and local government inclusion and participation in the internet governance.
- ISPs should be involved in the child online protection through the use of their internet access policy.
- The country should put in place internet monitoring and evaluation mechanism and create forum for the academia actively involved
- Forensic experts should be incorporated in the internet law and policy making
- Youths should be engaged in the issues of internet governance.

- There should be establishment of Research Bank as a storehouse of researched works conducted by the Nigerian students in the university.

- Anti-plagiarism should be enforced and Nigeria students should be encouraged to make use of the tool for the protection of their works and maintenance of the originality of research project.

- Internet security should be resolved through the use of users' awareness and orientation program.

- There is need for total overhauling of the country legal framework in preparation towards cyberlaws. The country should emphasize on the promulgation of comprehensive cyberlaws rather than Cybersecurity law to accommodate all the strategic internet and e-commerce legal requirements.

Chapter Five

OBSERVATIONS

4.1 General Observations

The convocation of NIGF 2013 has been largely successful considering broad spectrum of stakeholders across various sectors and backgrounds. With more than 600 delegates within just 1year, the level of participations has justified the nationwide enthusiasms in the subject matter of internet governance. The Forum has successfully created a unified platform for a national discourse on internet governance issues specifically and ICT in broader perspectives. It has stimulated genuine and renew interests of stakeholders in the art of governance. More than ever before, stakeholders now appreciate the opportunity for equal engagement and contribution in general and critical issues of Internet governance. This is what has made Nigeria Governance Forum a unique and truly multi-stakeholders dialogue initiative.

The NIFG 2013 general consensuses are centered on the criticality of premium internet accessibility, availability, and sustainability driven through a robust and secure infrastructure, upon which the economy and developmental values chain are anchored.

As usual, the track sessions deliberated on critical issues revolving around internet governance in the country and how to promote and protect the nation's position on Internet governance at the Global Forum.

Time Management

On the other hand, the Forum initiated a new concurrent track session's management approach which saved time, thus engaging stakeholders more effectively and productively. The post Forum delegates expressions in the appraisal form attested to this observation.

4.2 Contention on the Government Overbearing nature on Policy Making

A contentious issue on the Government controlled of policy making ensued, it was agreed among the stakeholders that the policy making or development such as the internet governance policy matters should be remained a truly multi-stakeholder engagement with equal rights to participate and contribute. Policy making should be approached through the framework of multi-stakeholder engagement.

4.2 **Critical Areas of Concerns**

The following are the summation of stakeholders' critical areas of concerns as observed throughout the period of the dialogues at the 2013 Nigeria Internet Governance Forum.

i. Internet remains a vibrant and emerging medium for national integration and economy empowerment where government has not yet fully utilized its potentials.

ii. Internet access is no longer a privilege but a citizenship right.

iii. National need to balancing *right* to internet access with the *freedom* of Information.

iv. Absence of local internet research capability and statistical data generated locally on local internet penetration and internet utilization in the country.

v. Absence of National citizenship database.

vi. The reality of digital illiteracy and digital exclusion amid huge proliferation of digital mobile devices has enabled citizen digital capability but with low economy utilization rate.

vii. Internet security vulnerability and risk exposure are real in view of the foreign hosting of strategic government institution website. There is obvious porosity of our digital sovereignty

viii. Cashless society sustainability challenges due to underutilization of underground fiber optic cables and disjointed national distributive network.

ix. Growing youth population with youth restlessness and joblessness amid overwhelming under-utilized digital capability.

x. Isolation of telecom operators in the implementation of CBN cashless transaction policy.

xi. Non prioritization of national ICT strategic needs and disjointed ICT implementation without due regards to established process.

xii. Growing internal conflict and organized damages to the communication infrastructures.

xiii. Political wiliness needed to implement ICT policy and initiatives.

xiv. Non-utilization of the product of nation's academia research works by the industry.

xv. Multi-dimensional nature of social media including application for criminal tendencies.

xvi. Disjointed telecenter established across the country without sustainability plan

xvii. Policy inconsistency among public institutions

xviii. Access to ICT project funding

Chapter Six

CONCLUSION

The NIGF 2013 has produced stakeholders' inputs which would facilitate aggregation and harmonization of views and opinions for the country's position at the forthcoming Global Internet Governance forum in Bali, Indonesia 22-25 October.

Furthermore, the outcome also stimulates contributions from stakeholders towards the country ICT, Telecommunication and Broadband policies and strategies on ICT and internet development for national economic growth.

The one day event recorded a large turnout of delegates across the country and multi-stakeholders' sectors. With the incorporation of youth workshop, the attendance was higher than the NIGF 2012 record, and beyond the forecasted figures. The environment of the forum was general accommodating, secured and conducive but overflowed with delegates.

However, the delegates expressed satisfactions for the opportunity given to them to contribute to the Internet Governance Policy, while the moderators commended the coordination approach which saved time.

Chapter Seven

RECOMMENDATIONS/COMMUNIQUÉ

The 2013 edition of the Nigeria Internet Governance (NIGF 2013) has been successfully organized by the Local Multi-stakeholders Advisory Group (LMAG) comprising of the following:

- Federal Ministry of Communication Technology
- Nigerian Communications Commission
- National Information Technology Development Agency
- Nigeria Computer Society
- Nigeria Internet Registration Association
- Continental Project Affairs Associates
- DigitalSENSE Africa Media
- CTDI- Creative Tech. Development International
- Rosemary Taribi Foundation

The Forum, which was declared open by the Hon. Minister of Communication Technology, Mrs. Omobola Johnson, was held on the 18th of June, 2013 at the Shehu Musa Yar'adua Centre Abuja. The Forum was chaired by Dr Ernest Ndukwe (O.F.R) Co-Chairman Presidential Committee on Broadband and Chairman of Open Media Communications Ltd. The Forum commenced at 9:00am and ended at 5:30pm.

It was a one-day national dialogue and a preparatory meeting seeking various stakeholders' contributions towards the country's position on Internet Governance, and her participation at the forthcoming global IGF taking place on the 22 to 25 October 2013 in Bali, Indonesia.

The NIGF was set up to stimulate productive ideas, best practices and experiences that can be harnessed to addressing critical national challenges, as well as to provide common national platform for local stakeholder's interactions and input into Regional

and Global IGF 2013. The 2013 edition took advantage of the NIGF multi-stakeholder platform to empower Nigerian youths.

The Forum was attended by over 600 stakeholders from public institutions, private sector groups, civil societies, professional bodies, trade associations, academia, students and youths, military and para-military organizations, security and law enforcement agencies, government, law makers, ICT industry, internet users, and the public. Also in attendance were media groups from print, electronic and online, scholars and research scientists.

The Forum focused on the central Theme "Internet Governance for Empowerment, National Integration and Security through Multi-stakeholders' Engagement". This year's edition was more interactive. There were 3 general sessions and 6 parallel tracks covering the following:

- Digital Inclusion and Integration,
- Building Trust, Confidence, & Assurance on the Internet,
- Policy and Regulatory Model for the Internet,
- Encouraging Local Research on Internet Development in Nigeria,
- Addressing Critical Internet Resources and Infrastructure in the Cashless Society, Emerging Issues, Way Forward,
- Special Workshop for the NIGF Youth on "Business Opportunity in the Internet Industry".

At the end of the forum, viable ideas and alternative opportunities that can address the nation's most critical Internet issues, with diverse views and contributions were harmonized culminating into the following resolutions/recommendations:

1. National Information Technology Development Agency (NITDA) should develop a collaboration framework with National Bureau of Statistics (NBS) to create a biannual directory of ICT infrastructure and resources available in the country, as well to produce the annual status report with proper documentation of Internet utilization or users in Nigeria.

2. The (NBS) should fast track development of local internet research in partnership with Universities as collaborators in establishing data collections centres, and encourage graduating students/ research community who have IT knowledge to handle the problem of data collection from the field.

3. State governments should mandate their institutions to develop enforcement policies that will stimulate the official usage of Internet while making official engagement through internet as a state culture.

4. Government should make frantic effort to identify national ICT priority, develop a national internet research database with adequate funding for internet research, innovation and development in the country.

5. There should be dedicated national network infrastructures that can connect the government, industry and research community for the benefit of promoting knowledge engagement, open data system for researchers, innovation, end-users and researchers' synergy and IT development.

6. Government should harness and deploy internet research resources to facilitate agricultural revolution in the country.

7. Digital inclusion is a necessity to our development with huge advantages to the nation such as enhancing citizenship integrations, global competiveness, government revenues, national integrity, human development, skills and knowledge sharing and transfer. In the current definition of sovereignty, nations that are not technologically sovereign are not considered sovereign. Thus, our country should seek to achieve digital independence as a nation.

8. There should be a National Policy Guideline and Regulatory framework on Digital Inclusion and Integration that must address the following core essentials: Stakeholders' participation, data protection with legal framework, digital independence, adequate digital literacy infrastructural framework, and government direct intervention through her respective institutions.

9. There should be transformation of citizen's attitude and harmonization of citizen digital data through creation of a unified National Database which should include all citizens, particularly, women, youths, migrant communities, the physically challenged, grassroots, and corporate citizens.

10. The government should re-articulate her internet engagement policy in line with national priority on security and economic development.

11. There should be a declaration of state of emergency on ICT implementation and strategic engagement of critical local stakeholders, industry on the design framework and development in the country.

12. Government should develop a long-term infrastructure vulnerability mitigation strategy with close collaboration between government and the operators, in order to address infrastructure design weaknesses, protection and upgrades. This issue needs to rise to the level of a national agenda and given high priority status

13. There should be a national framework for the development of National Computer Emergency Readiness Team-ecosystem between the National CERT, sectorial and Individual CERTs to promote National synergy on cyber security, knowledge sharing and intelligence gathering on counter-measure against cybercrime injurious to the States and individuals.

14. There should a legal framework and standards through legislation that will provide protection for data/ information assets and ICT delivery services in the country, as well as ICT Governance framework that will drive the development of Internet in Nigeria.

15. There should be a national technical capacity building framework on Internet Forensic and e-Security Development, as well as engagement of ICT security experts and stakeholders in the formulation and continuous review of laws and policies for cyber security.

16. There should be enthronement of Institutional, Individual, and Corporate Transparency in the ICT project development and execution. This is critically imperative towards achieving trust in digital Nigeria.

17. There is critical need to build a multi-stakeholders collaboration framework on internet security, openness and privacy issues.

18. Government should bid for the hosting of African Internet Governance Forum 2014 while Local Multi-stakeholder Advisory Group of NIGF should liaise with Africa IGF to further seek areas opportunity with value chains outcome for the country.

19. The Forum noted with dismay that the Cyber Security Bill has been at the National Assembly for several years and request that the National Assembly expedites action in passing it into Law.

20. The Forum observed that the Satellite and Internet Backbone Service Providers, and the Broadcasting Industry players should be part of the future NIGF meetings as they are critical component of internet ecosystem.

21. The delegate generally agreed that the policy and regulatory framework for internet in Nigeria must ensure a level playing ground and the protection of all interests. There should be continuous Capacity Development for regulators.

22. The Forum noted that the era of Government being the sole maker of policies and regulations are gone. Government should adopt multi-stakeholder approach in making policies and regulations at all levels, while regulations of internet contents should be built on existing infrastructure regulatory models/platforms.

23. Government should expedite actions on the licensing of 4G broadband which would help in addressing the problem associated with separation of data from voice

24. Government also should consider ICT infrastructure as a Critical Economic and Security Infrastructure that must be protected.

25. Physical security of Fiber Optics infrastructure should be a joint responsibility of all stakeholders which include the government, the private sector and the host communities.

26. Government should encourage private entrepreneur, through provision of special incentives, to provide internet connectivity services at affordable cost to the public. This effort will help reduce the cost of governance at various levels, while facilitating digital inclusion and grassroots access to the internet.

27. Telecommunication Operators who are the backbone providers should upgrade their infrastructure to accommodate the growing demand for voice and data.

28. Internet through power line cable connection should be explored by the operators to improve connectivity.

29. The government should expedite action on the power project, this is necessary to stimulate exponential growth in the use and business of ICT in country. Power is the backbone of the emerging broadband industry.